Final Report

North Dakota Workforce Ecosystem Assessment

June 10, 2025



Workforce Development

Approach



Workforce Development

ASSESSMENT CONTEXT

Commerce aims to bolster the North Dakota workforce ecosystem by conducting a comprehensive assessment to gain a snapshot of the current-state landscape and to understand how current ecosystem programs and services operate.

NORTH DAKOTA BY THE NUMBERS



2nd Highest Labor Participation rate in the country at 69%¹



3rd Lowest Unemployment rate in the country, averaging 1.4% lower than the national average²



9+ agencies overseeing workforce development programs



80+ workforce development Programs



~16,300 job openings³





KEY OUTPUTS

Conduct a Comprehensive Workforce Ecosystem Maturity Assessment Engage Stakeholders for In-depth Insights



Develop Strategic Recommendations



Create Strategic Plans for WDC and WIOA Core Programs

<u>¹ND Job Service LMI, December 2024</u> <u>²United States Senate Joint Economic Committee, December 2024</u> ³ NDLMI Job Opening Statistics March 2025

ASSESSMENT APPROACH | TIMELINE

The assessment spanned approximately 20 weeks and provided ecosystem partners and customers multiple opportunities to participate and share feedback on strengths, gaps, and opportunities for improvement.



NORTH

Workforce Development

ASSESSMENT APPROACH | WORKFORCE ECOSYSTEM

A workforce development ecosystem has many components and players, all working together to support and train workers and to meet employer needs. In categorizing workforce programs and services, we can visualize relationships and how individuals and employers move throughout the ecosystem.



ASSESSMENT APPROACH | STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

 NORTH

 Dickota

 Be Legendary.

Workforce Development

A diverse group of stakeholders across the workforce ecosystem provided insights and perspectives on both current-state and future-state topics via a survey, interview, and focus groups.



Stakeholder Engagement Topics

- Successes & Challenges
- Measuring Program Efficacy
- Future Opportunities and Vision
- Program Availability, Familiarity, and Utilization

INTERVIEWS with leaders from North Dakota State agencies, community partners, and industry leaders 247 **EMPLOYERS** representing a variety of employer sizes and

> industries the employer survey

FOCUS GROUPS

with Educational Institutions, Regional Councils, Local Chambers, Workforce Center Managers, and Workforce Development Council Members

Current State: Findings Summary & Programs



Workforce Development

SUMMARY OF THEMES FROM ASSESSMENT FINDINGS



COMMON THEMES FROM THE ECOSYSTEM ASSESSMENT

Reduced **funding access and staffing numbers** is limiting program growth and service access

The limited **ability to share data and knowledge** across programs impacts the **customer experience**

The structure is **relationally-driven** with many strong partnerships, but access is based on **"who you know"**

The patchwork of programs and services would benefit from a **more unified leadership vision** to drive outcomes

There is an increasing need for **wraparound services** in communities to reduce **barriers to employment**

The state has a **breadth of programs** available, but **access is more limited** in rural and highly rural areas

There is **misalignment** in the labor market needs between **available workers and employer opportunities**

ECOSYSTEM MAP | PROGRAMS BY AGENCY





Current State: Interview and Focus Group Findings



Workforce Development

FUNDING & STAFFING



North Dakota has made great strides in funding workforce development programs, such as the Regional Workforce Impact Program (RWIP) and Job Placement Pilot Program (JP3). Although services needs have increased, federal and state funding for many programs has largely remained the same for many years, and federal funding restrictions make it difficult to innovate service delivery.



- "Our federal funding amount has stayed the same, but service needs have increased"
- "Everyone wears a lot of hats on their head and has a lot of irons in the fire"

F	U	Ν	D	IN	G

- State workforce development programs highlighted issues with stagnant federal funding sources year over year, due to North Dakota's small population
- RWIP and other local and regional innovation grants have given partners the opportunity to develop creative solutions to meet the needs of their populations
- Some programs, particularly education, have been especially impacted by inflation
- Interviewees expressed difficulty accessing additional federal, state, and regional grant funding

STAFFING

- State and regional workforce development programs cite the need for **increased staff** to address the **increased number of people seeking services**
- WIOA partners work hard to take care of their employees and retain knowledgeable, talented staff but are **unable to keep up with state raises due to tight budgets**

SERVICE SUSTAINABILITY

- Many state workforce development programs are concerned about their ability to **keep up with demand** for services and **maintain quality**
- **Rural areas require additional investment** to provide similar service and opportunities, such as CTE's mobile training units and transportation costs
- Regional partners have launched workforce attraction efforts, but programs do not have stable funding and could come to a halt

DATA & KNOWLEDGE SHARING

State workforce development programs cite that clients often need to provide the same information to multiple programs, creating duplicative intake points. State and regional workforce development programs and partners also expressed a desire to share best practices across workforce programs to maximize funding.

) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

"We need a centralized workforce development ecosystem to allow for peer learning & knowledge sharing, better data & program communication between regional and local level, and better program assessment"

DUPLICATIVE PROCESSES

- Jobseekers make employment plans with each state workforce program; workforce programs have a hard time aligning separate employment plans to ensure jobseekers aren't pulled in too many directions
- Stakeholders share that processes are overseen by too many separate workforce programs, leading customers to interact with many different agencies, especially when co-enrolled in programs

STRATEGIC ALIGNMENT

- State and regional workforce development programs foster great relationships and have meetings to talk about data, but desire more efficiency in data sharing
- Regional workforce program partners have difficulty tracking workforce development efforts, especially when metrics are spread out between systems (Job Service, WDC, DPI, CTE, etc.)





RELATIONALLY DRIVEN



State workforce programs, regional workforce partners, employers, and industry representatives recognize that knowledge of programs and services varies by individual. State leadership know who to call when they need to make a referral, but employers and jobseekers don't know all their available opportunities for workforce development.

) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "We need to find a better way to sync employers with job service. **Employers still don't** know where to go to find help."
- "The system is fragmented.
 I know who to call but most people don't"

PARTNERSHIPS

- North Dakota's workforce ecosystem has strong relationships between leaders
- Job Services' Workforce Centers are run by top-notch service providers and serve as an innovative hubs for ecosystem partnerships, offering programming spanning multiple agencies
- Several agencies shared that the partnerships between these
 agencies were strong: CTE and DPI; CTE and Commerce;
 Commerce and Job Service; Job Service and VocRehab
- State agencies appreciate that they can **easily access other agency leaders and legislators** for assistance
- **Programs care about each other's shared success** and willingly make referrals to other programs and services

DISPARATE PROGRAM KNOWLEDGE

- Both employers and jobseekers don't know which workforce development programs and wraparound supports are available to them, as a result programs are under-utilized
- Many stakeholders and ecosystem leaders recognized that while they have high ecosystem knowledge, the average customer does not

ECOSYSTEM STEERING



Many state programs expressed a desire for more alignment and leadership within the ecosystem to drive more effective outcomes through legislation and policy.

) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "There has been no go-to player, no defined leader for workforce"
- "We understand the needs of our local communities better than the state does"

LEADERSHIP

- State workforce programs and regional partners expressed a need for unified leadership to drive change in the workforce and serve as a central resource for customers
- Everyone is on everyone else's board or committee, and a good portion of that time is spent presenting on agency services
- Regional advisory groups work in relative isolation from each other

LEGISLATURE & POLICY

- Many programs have strong verbal support from legislators, but many interviewees expressed a desire for more alignment with workforce efforts and policymaking
- State workforce programs and regional partners expressed a lack of clarity in how data is evaluated as part of policy-making and funding allocation, exacerbating concerns about overall program funding
- Legislators need additional education on workforce ecosystem programs and services

WRAPAROUND SERVICES



North Dakota is making progress in providing wraparound services to address these needs of jobseekers and students. However, employers and workforce programs expressed that many individuals in North Dakota still experience barriers to employment, such as a lack of childcare, limited housing in many communities throughout the state, a lack of transportation to get to work or training, and issues with substance use.

) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "We need more open doors for lower-skilled individuals"
- "Childcare is a workforce issue"

INCREASED COMMUNITY NEEDS

- State programs, regional partners, and employers highlighted **barriers to employment across all regions**, with rural areas feeling the most impact
- Several programs meet the needs of specific populations, such as childcare assistance and employer-coordinated transportation
- State and regional programs express difficulty balancing community needs with the rules and regulations to receive federal funding

GETTING "JOB READY"

- Employers expressed a need for "job ready" workers who need minimal support, have basic employment skills, and consistently show up to work
- Job readiness can make job placement difficult for people who need additional support to get and sustain employment, particularly those with disabilities or in addiction recovery
- State and regional programs recognize that **job readiness isn't linear**, but have difficulty getting employers on board

AVAILABILITY & ACCESS



There are many programs and opportunities to address the needs of employers and jobseekers. Disparities in workforce development program access continue to be a challenge for both jobseekers and employers in rural areas.

) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "In rural areas, people have to get [to another city] to get to the bus"
- "Even if we get the applicants, we don't have housing"

BREADTH OF PROGRAMS

- There are many programs and opportunities to address the needs of employers and jobseekers
- State agencies, including but not limited to, Job Service, CTE, DPI, and Commerce are making great strides to ensure equal access to workforce programs
- Program offerings are more numerous in cities, particularly those with a workforce center or technical school
- Job Service and HHS lead the charge in available programming, partnering to offer reliable services through workforce centers

RURAL-URBAN DISPARITIES

- Regional workforce partners and employers expressed concern that the areas in the four corners of ND and in between larger cities are getting left behind
- State workforce programs and regional workforce partners emphasized that there were "different kinds of rural" when it came to wraparound services and workforce program availability
- Small business and rural employers feel the most strain in the labor market and have difficulty offering competitive wages

MISALIGNMENT OF LABOR MARKET NEEDS



Stakeholders expressed difficulty aligning worker interest and employer need, and an overall need for more workers in the state. Stakeholders recognize a need for education programs to rapidly keep up with changing workforce demands.

|) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

 "We have a vision for truly seamless transition between elementary, middle, high school, college, and work"

MATCHING WORKER INTEREST AND EMPLOYER NEED

- CTE requires local partners to complete a comprehensive local needs assessment
- Local chambers of commerce and regional development councils have a pulse on the local labor market
- Energy employers are hiring college and high school students before graduation and are still understaffed
- A remote CDL training program was costly to administer, but had **low registration numbers**

AGILITY IN TRAINING PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT

- State workforce programs and employers expressed a need for faster updates in education and training programs to keep up with changing workforce technology
- Change at the state level can be slow, which causes delays in regional program adaptability
- Technical Skills Training grant provides employers with additional support to develop highly skilled workers

Current State: Employer Survey Findings



Workforce Development

FINAL REPORT

EMPLOYER SURVEY INTRODUCTION

The information below describes the Employer Survey's purpose, methodology, distribution methods, and summary of survey topics.

Purpose

To gather key insights on skill gaps, hiring challenges, recruitment efforts, vacancy costs, and investments related to staffing and training, with additional special focus on employer apprenticeship offerings and employer use of Artificial Intelligence (AI).

Methodology

- Target Audience: Employers across all industries in North Dakota
- Survey Length: Designed to be completed in approximately 10 mins
- Question Types: Multiple-choice, short answer, and conditional questions to capture detailed responses

Impact

- Provides data-driven insights to shape workforce development policy
- Identifies areas where support and resources are needed
- Helps understand industry trends and challenges
- **Informs strategic decisions** on recruitment, training, and technology adoption

Distribution

We utilized the following **distribution methods** for the survey:

- Outreach to Industry Associations Distribution Lists(ND Commerce; Local Chambers of Commerce; etc.)
- Social Media Posts
- News Bulletins

Topics

Skill Gaps and Hiring Challenges:

- Questions on the types of skills most needed in businesses
- Challenges faced in recruiting and retaining workers

Recruitment Efforts:

- Types of recruitment activities businesses participate in
- Collaboration with educational institutions and workforce organizations

Vacancy Impact:

- Tracking the cost/impact of unfilled vacancies
- Posting vacancies on job boards

Apprenticeships:

- Current participation in registered apprenticeship programs
- Interest in offering or expanding apprenticeship opportunities

Use of Artificial Intelligence (AI):

- Current and future use of AI in business processes
- Views on AI in the workplace



DEMOGRAPHICS | RESPONSES AND EMPLOYER SIZES



The graphics below contain information on the number of unique employer responses to the survey and the distribution of employer size by number of employees for all survey responses.



Survey Responses by Employer Size

DEMOGRAPHICS | EMPLOYER LOCATIONS

Employer respondents primarily represented multiple locations across North Dakota, with some representation across other states and outside the country.







DEMOGRAPHICS | INDUSTRY REPRESENTATION

The chart below shows the industries represented by respondents of the employer survey.*



NORTH

Be Legendary

Workforce Development

FINAL REPORT

VACANCIES

Employers provided the following insights about their retention and recruitment efforts.



NORTH

Be Legendary

Workforce Development

FINAL REPORT

RECRUITING | CHALLENGES FROM EMPLOYERS

Employers provided the following insights about their recruitment challenges.



NORTH

NORTH Dakota Be Legendary. Workforce Development

RECRUITING | STRATEGIES

Employers were asked to select all recruitment strategies that their organization currently participates in.



CHALLENGES WITH RETAINING WORKERS



The survey included four base options on retention challenges, with the option for employers to write-in additional information². The percentage of employers facing a particular retention challenge is reflected in the table below.

lssue		% of employers ¹	Description of issue	
Workers not prepared for the workplace		39.7%	Workers lack interpersonal skills to retain work or keep up with work demands	
Compensa	ition not competitive	28.7%	Other employers offer better compensation packages	
Lack of career growth opportunities		21.5%	Employees are leaving for other opportunities to advance their careers	
Lack of relevant skills		20.6%	Employees lack technical or functional skills; are unable to attain skills after completing relevant training; are unable to get/maintain relevant licensure to keep job	
	No Issue with Retention	8.1%	No issue with retention; employers can retain employees, or are a sole proprietor/self-employed and do not have employees	-
	Relocation	7.7%	Employees are relocating to another part of the state or another part of the US; includes difficulty retaining employees due to cold weather	
	Work Hours/Schedule	4.0%	Work requires too many hours or too few hours (such as wanting full- time work when only part-time/seasonal opportunities are available); employees don't like work schedule (need more flexibility or predictability depending on the job)	
Other ²	Burnout	2.8%	Worker burnout and/or mental health strain from the industry	
	Economic Change/Financial Risk	2.4%	Economic risk for startups or small businesses; political climate leading to uncertainty with funding	
	Substance Use	2.0%	Drug and alcohol use; inability to pass a drug test	
	Lack of Childcare	2.0%	Leaving the workforce or unable to come back from parental leave due to lack of childcare	
	Aging Workforce	1.6%	Concerns for workers retiring and no talent in pipeline	
	Want Remote Work	1.2%	Workers want to work inside the home	

Workers not prepared for the workplace" is the top issue overall for employers surveyed.

Employers with **1-25 employees** were more likely to identify *"Lack of Relevant Skills"* as a top retention issue.

Employers with **more than 25 employees** were more likely to identify *"Compensation not Competitive*" as a top issue with retaining workers.

IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "[We have] employees not returning from maternity leave due to **issues finding affordable childcare**."
- "Currently no significant retention issues, but an aging workforce is presenting a challenge down the road."
- "The trades in general are short of personnel, competition is pricing the markets through the roof."
- "Employees [are] simply pursuing new opportunities."

FINAL REPORT

TALENT POOL | QUALITY OF APPLICANTS

Employers provided a range of insights on the talent pool and their perspectives on applicant quality.



same or declined in the last 4 years

KEY INSIGHT

While the talent pool has expanded and the overall number of applications has increased, the majority of employers surveyed believe that the quality of the talent pool has decreased in the last four years.

NORTH Workforce Development COMMERCE

- "There has always been a lack of qualified
- workplace, unable to work independently"

FINAL REPORT

confidence in younger applicants' soft skills

TALENT POOL | YOUNGER APPLICANT/WORKER SOFT SKILLS

Employers provided the following insights on the talent pool in relation to the "soft skills" of younger applicants.



Surveyed employers have mixed confidence in the soft skills of younger workers, with the plurality of employers expressing a neutral sentiment.

NORTH

Workforce Development

PARTNERSHIP | WORKFORCE PROGRAM PARTICIPATION

Employers were asked about their general participation in workforce training programs, including workforce development programs offered through the State of ND. Of the employers that participate in any type of workforce program, 15.8% use a private company to train employees.



Program Type	Description	
Private Training	Training offered by a private company or third party	
Higher Education Partnership	Training or degree program offered by a Higher Education Institution (including professional development and internshi	
Government or Regulatory Body	Training offered and facilitated by a government agency (local, state, or federal) or regulatory body	
In-House or Employer Sponsored Training	Corporate trainings or trainings designed and developed by the company itself	
Professional Association	Training or development program offered by a professional association	
K-12 Partnership Training or development program done in partnership with a K-12 institution (including internships and other will learning)		
Apprenticeship	Training program through apprenticeship (includes both registered and non-registered apprenticeships)	

NORTH

Workforce Development

PARTNERSHIP | EMPLOYER PARTNER ENGAGEMENT

Employers were asked about partnerships they engage with and which universities they partner with.



NORTH

Be Legendary

Workforce Development



JOB SERVICE FAMILIARITY

Employers were asked about their familiarity with Job Service and the programs and services they provide.



Overall, employers surveyed have relatively high familiarity and use of Job Service programs and services.



COMMERCE FAMILIARITY

Employers were asked about their familiarity with Commerce's Workforce Development Division.



IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "We don't really have a relationship"
- "We are aware of them but have no real relationship"
- "We have a great relationship with Commerce staff and have been building one with OLI."
- "We use their job board for our openings"¹
- "We use them for Unemployment Insurance (UI)"¹
- "We utilize Career Builder² and **Operation Intern**"

14.2%

15%

7.3%

7.3%

10%

5.7%

3.6%

5%

- "We have no relationship but have considered **Operation Intern**."
- "Our relationship is Fabulous! The team supports our communities at the highest level they can."

KEY INSIGHT

Most surveyed employers are unfamiliar with Commerce's Workforce Development Division or have misconceptions about the services they offer.

0.8%

¹ These services are administered by Job Service, not Commerce. ² Career Builders is under NDUS. This indicates a need for employer education on agency responsibilities and programs.

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL (WDC) FAMILIARITY

Employers were asked about their familiarity with the Workforce Development Council.

WDC Familiarity of Employers by Size



71% of employers surveyed are <u>not</u> familiar with the WDC

💡) KEY INSIGHT

29% of employers indicated they were familiar with the North Dakota Workforce Development Council, however, **many employers listed programs under other state agencies when asked about their business relationship with the WDC** including:

- JP3 (Job Service)
- ND Career Builders (NDUS)
- Grants offered by ND Dept. of Commerce

This indicates some surveyed employers have a **misunderstanding of the WDC's role.**



) IN OUR OWN WORDS...

- "I hear updates on the work of [WDC] typically through attending workshops, seminars, LinkedIn posts and local news"
- "We participate with meetings and providing local information to the council"
- "I work with them and utilize some of their programs for the justice involved people"
- "[We] use the ND Career Builders Scholarship & Loan Repayment Program"



Number of

Active

Apprentices

(2025)²

1,675

507

4,138

1,461

11,244

2,515

APPRENTICESHIPS | APPRENTICESHIP LANDSCAPE

The information below details the landscape of apprenticeships in North Dakota compared to peer states as well as information on approved registered apprenticeships through USDOL.



- Office of Apprenticeship (OA) State: States that offer Registered Apprenticeships through the USDOL's Office of Apprenticeship
- + State Apprenticeship Agency (SAA) State: States that offer Registered Apprenticeships through their own state agency

Different registered **apprenticeship** paths currently offered by the USDOL

Registered Apprenticeships are available for

- Agriculture
- Construction •
- Education ٠
- ٠ Energy

٠

Financial Services

- Healthcare
 - Hospitality
 - Technology
 - Telecommunication
 - Transportation

Apprenticeship.gov Partner Listing| https://www.apprenticeship.gov/partner-finder/listings

² Apprenticeship.gov State Dashboard | https://www.apprenticeship.gov/data-and-statistics/apprentices-by-state-dashboard

FINAL REPORT

APPRENTICESHIPS | EMPLOYER OFFERINGS

Employers were asked about their current registered apprenticeship offerings.



Workforce Development



REGISTERED APPRENTICESHIP OFFERINGS AND MISUNDERSTANDINGS



of employers surveyed currently offer registered apprenticeships* * Responses indicate *employers surveyed may have misconceptions or misunderstandings* about what a registered apprenticeship is.

When asked about current registered apprenticeship offerings, employers listed other work-based learning or job training opportunities such as:

- "Counseling student internships"
- "A loan forgiveness program"
- "We offer a co-op"

Only 16% of employers (1.6% of total survey responses) who indicated that they offer registered apprenticeships were found on the USDOL's registered apprenticeship sponsor list.¹



60%

of employers **don't offer registered apprenticeships** or say that registered apprenticeships **aren't applicable to their business**

This suggests an opportunity to **educate employers** about the **1,100+** registered apprenticeships and relevant state industries.

> of employers offering registered apprenticeships have **more than 50 employees**

APPRENTICESHIPS | REASONS FOR NOT OFFERING

Employers were asked about their reasons for not offering registered apprenticeships.



NORTH

Workforce Development

FINAL REPORT

ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (AI) | VIEW ON AI

Employers were asked about their company's overall view on AI.







ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (AI) | CURRENT USE

Employers were asked whether they currently use AI in the workplace, and if so, how they utilize AI.



Current Use of AI by Business Size (# of Employees)



FINAL REPORT

ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (AI) | FUTURE USE

Employers were asked about which ways they intend to use AI in the future.





39

Future State: Recommendations



Workforce Development



RECOMMENDATIONS | FOCUS AREA OVERVIEW



There are four primary areas of focus that positions the solutions that North Dakota should consider to improve the workforce ecosystem.

FOCUS AREAS	DESCRIPTION
I OCOS AREAS	
Strategic Vision	Provide clear vision for ecosystem steering , determine what goals to prioritize , and define roles and responsibilities for programs and partners . Define strategic vision for better alignment across programs , the ability to understand program needs , and set funding priorities that align with overall goals.
Customer Focus	Streamline entry points to programs and services within the ecosystem and/or work to encourage "warm handoffs" between programs. Develop a strategy for assessing customer needs and engaging with customers to understand gaps in programming.
Awareness and Engagement	Enhance and build relationships across programs and regions to better engage with communities and partners across the ecosystem. Develop strategies for socializing programs to employers, jobseekers, and students. Share programs successes to encourage collaboration and celebrate accomplishments.
Information Tracking and Sharing	Identify success metrics across programs that align with ND's workforce strategic vision and track success to support objective program decisions and assess program efficacy over time. Develop a strategy for data sharing to enhance program efficiency and improve customer service.

RECOMMENDATIONS | LIST OF TOP OPPORTUNITIES

 NORTH

 Dickoto

 Be Legendary.

 COMMERCE

In alignment with the four focus areas, 13 recommendations have been developed to align with the top opportunities for the state to address to improve workforce ecosystem operations and efficiencies.

FOCUS AREAS		LIST OF RECO	LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS		
Strategic Vision	Unified State Vision (1A)	Define Roles & Partnerships (1B)	Alignment Across Agencies & Regions (1C)	Understanding Funding Priorities (1D)	
Customer Focus	Single Entry Point (2A)	Warm Handoffs (2B)	Align Program Offerings to Customer Needs (2C)	Workforce of the Future (2D)	
Awareness and Engagement	Program Awareness (3A)	Sharing Program Successes (3B)	Relationship Building & Connections (3C)		
Information Tracking and Sharing	Measuring Information (4A)	Data Sharing (4B)			

RECOMMENDATIONS | DESCRIPTIONS



NORTH

Workforce Development

RECOMMENDATIONS | DESCRIPTIONS



NORTH

Workforce Development